

## Activity 1: Marking the Counterargument

**Directions:** Read the opposition's claim and corresponding counterargument below. Using the key, mark the counterargument paragraph to identify its components.

ANNOTATION KEY	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>qualifying language (concession) = Bracket</li><li>opposition's point of view (concession) = underline</li><li>rebuttal = highlight</li></ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>cohesion created through ideas = double underline</li><li>cohesion created through language = box</li><li>transitions = circle</li></ul>

**Opposition's Claim:** National ID cards would deprive people of their privacy, so the disadvantages outweigh the advantages.

### Counterargument:

While national ID cards could lessen a person's anonymity and privacy, this is a small loss that would be offset by a great increase in personal security. This tradeoff would be well worth it. According to Dershowitz, the national ID card would be only a little more intrusive than a photo ID card or social security card. Best of all, it would reduce or eliminate the need for racial profiling: "Anyone who had the [national ID] card could be allowed to pass through airports or building security more expeditiously, and anyone who opted out could be examined much more closely" (590). Such cards would enable airport security officials to do instant background checks on everyone. The personal information in the system would stay in the system and never be made public. The only information on the card would be a person's name, address, photo, and fingerprint.

Adapted from online source, Mesa Community College

## Activity 2: Counterargument Puzzle

**Directions:** Below you will find the individual sentences in a counterargument paragraph separated and reordered. Read the sentences, and with your group, discuss and effectively reorder, by numnering, the pieces of the counterargument puzzle. Be prepared to defend your choices.

### Opposition's claim:

Doctor-assisted suicide is the impulsive decision of a depressed patient.

\_\_\_\_\_ For example, Girsh states that patients who consider assisted suicide are aware of their exact medical condition through a mutual exchange of information with their doctors, these patients understand their medical treatment along with risk, benefits and other options, and they must talk with a psychologist to determine if they are psychologically able to make such a decision (1999).

\_\_\_\_\_ However, all of those terminally ill patients who after psychotherapy finally choose to hasten their deaths are very determined.

\_\_\_\_\_ In "Opposing Views on Assisted Suicide," Faye Girsh points out that many dying patients want to know about how to get help from a doctor to achieve a peaceful death even if ultimately they do not choose suicide (1999).

\_\_\_\_\_ In other words, terminally ill patients who voluntarily choose to ask doctors to help them commit suicide are those who decide carefully to take advantage of the doctor-assisted suicide law.

\_\_\_\_\_ It may be true that all such requests, in which dying patients ask doctors to help them to kill themselves, come from depression as some psychologists have claimed and that some patients will change their minds if they participate in psychotherapy.

\_\_\_\_\_ These are not patients who want to end their lives simply because they are depressed. 7.) In short, terminally ill patients who finally choose to ask doctors to help them commit suicide are mentally competent and very determined about what they want to choose.

## Activity 2: Counterargument Puzzle Sentences for Strips

**Directions to the teacher:** Print this sheet and separate each sentence by cutting them into strips. Write the opposition's claim on the board. In groups, have the students reorder them by lining them up vertically in the order they believe is the most effective. You may choose to make it a race as a kinesthetic game. On the last page, you will find the answer key.

**Opposition's claim:**

Doctor-assisted suicide is the impulsive decision of a depressed patient.

-----

For example, Girsh states that patients who consider assisted suicide are aware of their exact medical condition through a mutual exchange of information with their doctors, these patients understand their medical treatment along with risk, benefits and other options, and they must talk with a psychologist to determine if they are psychologically able to make such a decision (1999).

However, all of those terminally ill patients who after psychotherapy finally choose to hasten their deaths are very determined.

In "Oposing Views on Assisted Suicide," Faye Girsh points out that many dying patients want to know about how to get help from a doctor to achieve a peaceful death even if ultimately they do not choose suicide (1999).

In other words, terminally ill patients who voluntarily choose to ask doctors to help them commit suicide are those who decide carefully to take advantage of the doctor-assisted suicide law.

It may be true that all such requests, in which dying patients ask doctors to help them to kill themselves, come from depression as some psychologists have claimed and that some patients will change their minds if they participate in psychotherapy.

These are not patients who want to end their lives simply because they are depressed. 7.) In short, terminally ill patients who finally choose to ask doctors to help them commit suicide are mentally competent and very determined about what they want to choose.

## Counterargument Puzzle Answer Key

### Counterargument:

1.) It may be true that all such requests, in which dying patients ask doctors to help them to kill themselves, come from depression as some psychologists have claimed and that some patients will change their minds if they participate in psychotherapy. 2.) However, all of those terminally ill patients who after psychotherapy finally choose to hasten their deaths are very determined. 3.) In "Opposing Views on Assisted Suicide," Faye Girsh points out that many dying patients want to know about how to get help from a doctor to achieve a peaceful death even if ultimately they do not choose suicide (1999). 4.) In other words, terminally ill patients who voluntarily choose to ask doctors to help them commit suicide are those who decide carefully to take advantage of the doctor-assisted suicide law. 5.) For example, Girsh states that patients who consider assisted suicide are aware of their exact medical condition through a mutual exchange of information with their doctors, these patients understand their medical treatment along with risk, benefits and other options, and they must talk with a psychologist to determine if they are psychologically able to make such a decision (1999). 6.) These are not patients who want to end their lives simply because they are depressed. 7.) In short, terminally ill patients who finally choose to ask doctors to help them commit suicide are mentally competent and very determined about what they want to choose.

Adapted from online source, Heinle & Heinle, 2006.