The goal of some artists is to imitate life. Their works are lifelike, down to the smallest detail. The goal of other artists is to create a mood or feeling. What do you think was the goal of the artist who created this work? Explain your reaction.

In the second half of the twentieth century, a new form of three-dimensional art emerged on the scene. It was the installation. Installations are artworks made not to be walked around but walked through as one walks through a room. The installation in Figure 2.1 is one of a series of creations by American Pop artist Red Grooms (b. 1937). Pop art is a style of art that explores everyday subjects and objects from contemporary culture. In Grooms’s “Ruckus” series, the artist created life-sized environments such as Manhattan or a Texas rodeo and inhabited these fun, offbeat environments with cartoonlike characters.

**Identify.** Compare and contrast the contemporary styles in Figure 2.1 and Figure 2.6 on page 32 to identify the general themes of the works. Note that a theme could be revealed in the subject matter or as a concept communicated by the work.
There are professional critics who appear on television or write reviews about new movies, plays, television shows, videos, books, art exhibits, and music. These critics describe their responses to various forms of art, and give you their assessment of the merits of the works. You may not always agree with their opinions because your criteria, or standards of judgment, may be very different from those of the professional critic. In this chapter you will learn about aesthetics, the philosophy or study of the nature and value of art. This will allow you to form your own intelligent opinions about works of art. You will also learn about art criticism. Art criticism is an organized approach for studying a work of art.

Why Study Art Criticism?

What do you think of when you hear the word criticism? Do you think it means saying something negative? This is not true. A criticism can be a positive statement. For example, when you shop for clothes, you try on many things. You act as a critic using personal criteria to determine which pieces of clothing look good on you and which pieces do not suit you. You have developed your own criteria for choosing clothing through personal experience.

When you look at Alma Thomas’s painting, *Iris, Tulips, Jonquils, and Crocuses* (Figure 2.2), you may experience confusion. You may not have had enough experience to develop a set of criteria to judge a work that has no recognizable subject. If you are like most people who are new to art, you may not know what to say.

> **Figure 2.2** At first glance, this painting appears to consist of simple shapes and bright colors. The title of the work, however, should help you understand what the dabs of color represent. Notice how large the painting is. How big does that make each dab of color? Can you imagine the garden these flowers would grow in?

Art criticism is not difficult. In fact, it can be a lot of fun. At the very least, it can make the study of art less mysterious and more logical. Art criticism is a sequential approach for looking at and talking about art.

Your own life experiences may also help you understand the meaning of each work of art. No one has done or seen exactly the same things you have, so no one will see exactly what you see in a work of art. No one can think exactly the way you think. You may see ideas in a work of art that were never dreamed of by the artist. This does not mean that you are wrong; it simply means that the work of art is so powerful that it has a special meaning for everybody.

Learning art criticism will help you interpret works of art. It will give you the confidence to discuss works of art without worrying about what other people might think. It will help you to organize your thoughts. You will develop the courage to speak your mind and make sound aesthetic judgments.

As you learn the language of art, you will be able to “dig deeper” into the layers of meaning of each art object. The deeper you dig, the more important your feelings for that work of art will become. This will make your aesthetic experience, or your personal interaction with a work of art, more meaningful and memorable. The work will then become a permanent part of your memory.

The Steps of Art Criticism

When you become involved in the process of art criticism, you learn from the work of art. Critiquing an artwork is like playing detective. You must assume the artist has a secret message hidden within the work. Your job is to find the message and solve the mystery.

In this chapter you will learn a special four-step approach that will help you find the hidden meanings in art. The four steps, which must be taken in order, are description, analysis, interpretation, and judgment. By following these steps you will be able to answer the following questions:

- What do I see? (description)
- How is the work organized? (analysis)
- What message does this artwork communicate? (interpretation)
- Is this a successful work of art? (judgment)

As you go through the steps of description and analysis, you will collect facts and clues. When you get to interpretation, you will make guesses about what message you think the artwork is communicating. Finally, during judgment, you will make your own decisions about the artistic merit of the work.

Step One: Description (What do I see?)

In the first step of art criticism, description, you carefully make a list of all the things you see in the work. These include the following:

- The size of the work, the medium used, and the process used.
- The subject, object, and details.
- The elements of art used in the work.

During the description step, notice the size of the work and the medium used. You will find these facts in the credit line. This information will help you visualize the real size and look of the work. Notice that Figure 2.4 on page 29 and Figure 2.6 on page 32 are about the same size as reproduced in this book. Read both credit lines and notice the difference in the actual size of each work.
Look at the painting by José Clemente Orozco called Barricade (Figure 2.3). Notice that the work is 55 inches tall. How does that compare to your own height? If this artwork were standing on the floor, would the figures be larger or smaller than you? What materials were used to create this work?

During the description step, you must be objective. In describing Orozco’s painting, you can say that you see five people. You could not say they are all men. That would be a guess. You can describe the person crouched on the ground as wearing a blue shirt and holding a large knife. You can describe the tense muscles that are bulging on the other four figures, but at this point in the criticism process, you should not try to guess why they are tense.

Look again at Figure 2.3. Line and color are two of the art elements that play an important part in this work. Can you identify the other art elements used?

Look at Figure 2.2 on page 26. This is a nonobjective work. In nonobjective works, the art elements become the subject matter.

**Step Two: Analysis (How is the work organized?)**

During this step, you are still collecting facts about the elements and principles of art that are used in the artwork. In analysis you discover how the principles of art are used to organize the art elements of line, color, value, shape, form, space, and texture. You will learn how the artist has used these formal qualities to create the content of the art, which is known as the theme or the message. Look at The Piper by Hughie Lee-Smith (Figure 2.4). Notice the horizontal line that passes behind the boy’s shoulders. Where are the darkest colors? Where are the lightest colors? Is the texture of the bricks on the wall the same as the texture of the plaster? As you learn more about the elements and principles, you will be able to collect more clues that you can use to interpret each work.

**Figure 2.3** Orozco was one of the Mexican muralists who combined the solid forms of ancient Mexican art with the powerful colors of European Expressionism. This work depicts the peasants fighting for freedom during the Mexican Revolution in 1910. What could you do to find out more about the event this painting depicts?

Step Three: Interpretation
(What message does this artwork communicate to you?)

During this step, you will answer the question, “What message does this artwork communicate to me?” In interpretation you will explain or tell the meaning or mood of the work. It is here that you can make guesses about the artwork, as long as they appear to be supported by what you see in the work. Use your intelligence, imagination, and courage. Don’t be afraid to make an interpretation that is different from someone else’s. After all, you are different from other people. Your interpretation will be influenced by what you have experienced and seen in your life.

Your interpretation can be based on your feelings, but your feelings must be backed up by the visual facts and clues you collected during the first two steps.

When you look at Figure 2.4, you see a crumbling wall with the shadow of a neatly shaped modern building falling on it. Then you notice the boy standing between the modern building and the crumbling wall. He is playing a musical instrument. What is the meaning of the boy and his instrument? What message does this work communicate to you?

Step Four: Judgment (Is this a successful work of art?)

In this step you will judge whether or not the work is successful. In judgment you determine the degree of artistic merit. This is the time to make your own decisions. There are two levels of judgment to be made. The first is personal. Do you like the work? No one can ever tell you what to like or dislike. You must make up your own mind. To make a fair judgment, you must be honest with yourself. Only you know why you feel the way you do. Otherwise, you may close yourself off from experiencing different kinds of art. The second level of judgment you must make is also subjective, but it is somewhat different. At this point, you use aesthetics to help you decide whether the work is successful. A work can be very successful aesthetically, but you might not want to live with it.
CHAPTER 2 Art Criticism and Aesthetic Judgment

To make a judgment, you must take your time. Figure 2.5 is a painting by Georgia O’Keeffe. To judge this painting, first think about how you would describe the subject of the painting. Then consider how the artist has arranged the art elements according to the art principles in order to create the composition. Notice how she has used shading to make the skull look solid and the drapery look like a hanging banner. However, she has painted the red borders and the black shape behind the skull flat. Then, think about the feeling the painting gives you. By taking time to look at and describe, analyze, and interpret what you think the meaning of the painting might be, you will be able to make an intelligent judgment. Ask yourself, is this a work of artistic merit? Is it successful?

Check Your Understanding

1. What is aesthetics?
2. Name and describe the four steps of art criticism in order.

MEET THE ARTIST

GEORGIA O’KEEFFE

American, 1887–1986

From the time she was a child, Georgia O’Keeffe knew she was going to be an artist. She studied with several teachers. At age 29, she decided to focus totally on nature and she burned her earlier works in order to start fresh, emphasizing shapes and forms. The flower paintings that made her famous were begun at this time. She painted her flowers big so that they would take viewers by surprise. She continued following her own vision throughout her long life, never being pulled into any of the many movements that have dominated the American art scene during the twentieth century.

O’Keeffe loved to see “connections” in the shapes of ordinary things. After painting a shell and shingle many times, she painted a mountain. It was only later that she realized that she had given the mountain the same shape as the shell and the shingle. She saw beautiful forms everywhere, even in the most unusual places, such as the vast desert spaces and parched bones found near her home in New Mexico.

To make a judgment, you must take your time. Figure 2.5 is a painting by Georgia O’Keeffe. To judge this painting, first think about how you would describe the subject of the painting. Then consider how the artist has arranged the art elements according to the art principles in order to create the composition. Notice how she has used shading to make the skull look solid and the drapery look like a hanging banner. However, she has painted the red borders and the black shape behind the skull flat. Then, think about the feeling the painting gives you. By taking time to look at and describe, analyze, and interpret what you think the meaning of the painting might be, you will be able to make an intelligent judgment. Ask yourself, is this a work of artistic merit? Is it successful?

Check Your Understanding

1. What is aesthetics?
2. Name and describe the four steps of art criticism in order.

Figure 2.5 Georgia O’Keeffe loved the West. She shocked the public with paintings of objects from her environment that people were not used to seeing hanging on a wall. She painted Cow’s Skull: Red, White, and Blue because she wanted to create something uniquely American. Do you think she succeeded?

Aesthetics is a branch of philosophy concerned with the nature and value of art. Physical beauty was once the only criterion for judging the quality of art. Today, artwork is judged by a different set of criteria and instead of being called “beautiful,” a good work of art is called “successful.” Some successful works of art may not look pretty, but they may be well-organized, and/or elicit emotional responses from viewers.

Aesthetic Theories and the Quality of Art

The aesthetic qualities that are discussed most often by aestheticians (specialists in aesthetics) are the literal qualities, the formal qualities, and the expressive qualities. These are directly related to the properties of art discussed in Chapter 1 on pages 18 and 19: subject, composition, and content. The literal qualities are the realistic qualities that appear in the subject of the work. For instance, if the artist depicts a realistic figure of a man on a horse, the literal qualities of the work are the images of a man on a horse. The formal qualities, or the organization of the elements of art by the principles of art, are found when you look at the composition of the work. Does it look balanced? Is there a rhythmic quality? Is there variety? Has the artist made a unified work of art? These are the types of questions one must ask to determine how well-organized a work is. The expressive qualities, or those qualities that convey ideas and moods, are those you notice when you study the content of a work. Is there something in the work that makes you feel a certain emotion or conveys an idea to you?

The three aesthetic theories of art criticism are most commonly referred to as Imitationalism, Formalism, and Emotionalism.

Imitationalism and Literal Qualities

Some critics think that the most important thing about a work of art is the realistic presentation of subject matter. It is their opinion that a work is successful if it looks like and reminds the viewer of what he or she sees in the real world. People with this point of view feel that an artwork should imitate life, that it should look lifelike, before it can be considered successful. This aesthetic theory, called Imitationalism, focuses on realistic representation.

Formalism and Formal Qualities

Other critics think that composition is the most important factor in a work of art. This aesthetic theory, called Formalism, places emphasis on the formal qualities, the arrangement of the elements of art using the principles of art.
Emotionalism and Expressive Qualities

This theory is concerned with the content of the work of art. Some critics claim that no object can be considered art if it fails to arouse an emotional response in the viewer. The expressive qualities are the most important to them. Their theory, called Emotionalism, requires that a work of art must arouse a response of feelings, moods, or emotions in the viewer.

Look at Papiamento by Julio Larraz (Figure 2.6). You may use the theory of Imitationalism to judge this work as successful because the artist has painted everything very accurately. You can recognize the texture of the freshly pressed, white cotton dress, the light flickering on the large, tropical leaves, the texture of the trunk of the palm tree, the palm fronds, the yellow sand of the beach, and the beautiful blue of the Caribbean waters. Someone else may choose the theory of Formalism to judge the work as successful because the artist has arranged the objects so that the foreground is in shadow and the background glows brightly with sunshine. A third person may choose the theory of Emotionalism because of the mysterious mood created by hiding the woman in the shadow of the tree, or because the painting may arouse in the viewer emotional associations with memories of a vacation on a Caribbean island.

You can judge art using just one aesthetic theory or more than one, depending on the type of art and your own purposes. If you limit yourself to using only one theory, however, you may miss some exciting discoveries in a work. Perhaps the best method is to use all three. Then you will be able to discover as much as possible about a particular piece of art.
Judging Functional Objects

You can use art criticism to make aesthetic judgments about functional objects such as cars, shoes, or fine china. The objects in Figure 2.7 are an example. In criticizing functional objects, you follow the first two steps of art criticism—description and analysis—as described earlier. However, during the third step, interpretation, you must consider the purpose of the object as its meaning. In the last step, judgment, you must consider if the object works when it is used. That is, does it look like it will function properly? A chair may look beautiful, but if it is not comfortable to sit in, then it does not function properly. It is unsuccessful.

When you study a ceremonial object from a culture you are not familiar with, refer to the title and your observations during the first two steps of art criticism. During interpretation, you must imagine the function of the object and then judge it using one of the three aesthetic theories. Finally, research the object using the art history operations in the next lesson and refine your interpretation and judgment.

Check Your Understanding

1. What are the three aesthetic qualities most often discussed by art critics?
2. What is Imitationalism?
3. Compare and contrast Formalism and Emotionalism.
4. How does judging functional objects differ from judging fine art?
Art History: Learning About a Work of Art

You can develop your appreciation for a work of art by gathering information about the artist and the time period in which the work was created. This is the historical and cultural context of the work. The art history operations are a four-step approach for organizing the way you gather information about a work of art. The names for the four steps of art history operations are the same as the four steps for art criticism: description, analysis, interpretation, and judgment. For art history operations, however, there are different definitions for the terms and different questions to be answered.

- **Description.** When, where, and by whom was the work done?
- **Analysis.** What is the style of the work and can the work be associated with an art movement?
- **Interpretation.** How did time and place affect the artist’s style, in terms of subject matter, composition, and content?
- **Judgment.** Is the work considered to be significant in the history of art?

### Step One: Description

During this step you will look for information about the work of art. You want to know who did it, when, and where it was done. If you were looking at an original work of art, you would look for the artist’s signature and the date on the work itself. In this book, because the works have been reduced to fit on the page, you will probably not be able to see the artist’s signature or the date on the work. You will find that information in the credit line, however. If you look at the credit line for Figure 2.8, you will discover that this painting was created by the same artist who painted Figure 2.9, Ernst Ludwig Kirchner. Figure 2.9 was painted in 1907. Compare that date to Figure 2.8.

Ernst Ludwig Kirchner. *Winter Landscape in Moonlight*. 1919. Oil on canvas. 120.7 × 120.7 cm (47 1/2 × 47 1/2 in.), Detroit Institute of Arts, Detroit, Michigan. Gift of Curt Valentin in memory of the occasion of Dr. William R. Valentin’s 60th birthday.

**Figure 2.8** The objects in this work are easy to recognize—trees, mountains, and night sky—but the colors are not what you might expect. Why do you think the artist used these colors? What does he appear to be saying?
Which was painted earlier? To learn more about Kirchner, such as where and when he lived, you would need to do some further research.

**Step Two: Analysis**

During analysis, you examine the work and look for information about the artist’s style. Style is like handwriting. No two people have exactly the same handwriting and no two artists have exactly the same style. **Individual style** is the artist’s personal way of using the elements and principles of art to express feelings and ideas. To analyze the style of one artist, you will need to see several works by the same artist. When you look at Figure 2.8 and Figure 2.9, you can easily see the unique aspects of the artist’s style: his unusual use of color and his exaggeration of shapes for expressive effect.

**Step Three: Interpretation**

In order to find the answers for this step you will have to do some research. You will discover that the artist was active in a group of young, adventurous artists in Germany who called themselves Die Brücke (The Bridge) and that their work was part of a larger movement known as German Expressionism. In order to interpret his work, you would need to find out what other artists influenced him, details about his life, and information about his surroundings. 

**Step Four: Judgment**

Once again you must research to find out the importance of this work in the history of art. You must discover what different art historians have to say about Kirchner and use their assessments to help you shape your own. You can also discover if Kirchner influenced other artists, which would help you judge his importance.

As you study the information in this book and learn more about the language of art, you will begin to acquire information from works of art. You will learn more about the artists who created the works. In Chapters 12 and 13, you will find a brief overview of art history. Refer to these chapters to learn more about art movements and time periods as you encounter them throughout the book.

**Check Your Understanding**

1. What are the art history operations?
2. Describe each of the steps of art history operations.
3. What is individual style?
Critiquing the Artwork

Figure 2.10 is a mask-headdress. When it is worn, the performer's body is covered with fresh palm fronds.

1 **DESCRIBE** What do you see?
   - Read the credit line for information about this work.
   - List the information from the credit line.
   - Do you recognize any objects or figures? Describe them.
   - Based on its size and the materials used, do you think the work is heavy or light? Explain.

2 **ANALYZE** How is this work organized?
   - This step deals with the formal qualities. It is a clue-collecting step. You will note the art elements used as well as the art principles that organize them.
   - What shape is repeated on the horse's platform?
   - Where do you find the same repeated shapes?
   - What proportion of this sculpture is the helmet-mask?

3 **INTERPRET** What message does this artwork communicate to you?
   - The third step is concerned with content. This is where you make guesses about the meaning of the work. Remember that you do not need to know what the artist meant. Instead, decide what this headdress communicates to you.
   - From the measurements given in the credit line, do you think the helmet section is a hat or a mask?
   - Why is this work decorated with painted patterns?
   - On what type of occasion would you imagine the headdress is worn? By whom is it worn? Explain.
   - What do you think it would feel like to have your body covered with palm fronds and the headdress on your head? How would you want to move?
   - What do you think this headdress communicates? Write a brief story or poem about this mask-headdress.

4 **JUDGE** What do you think of the work?
   - Now, you are ready to make an aesthetic judgment.
   - Do you think this is a successful ceremonial work of art? Use one or more of the three aesthetic theories explained in this chapter to defend your judgment.

The Yoruba people, who number over 12 million, live in southwest Nigeria and southern Benin. They are the most urban of all African groups. Their founding city, Ile-Ife, was the center of a successful city-state in the eleventh century. The masquerade, for which headdresses like this one are designed, is a multi-media event. It involves costumes, music, dance, drama, and poetry. The audience participates in it. This complex headdress is, thus, meant not only to be seen in a static setting but also to be worn in a performance. Imagine the play of light and shadow as a performer covered with palm fronds wears this headdress and moves in time with the music and the storytelling.
Pablo Picasso and Henri Matisse did not always judge each other’s work kindly.

Pablo Picasso and Henri Matisse, two leaders of the twentieth-century art world, were rivals. Each thought he was the better painter. Each was jealous of the other’s fame. The two, however, respected and influenced each other’s work. Picasso showed his respect for Matisse in a painting he created a year after Matisse’s death in 1954. Like Matisse’s Red Interior Still Life on a Blue Table, Picasso’s Studio of “La Californie” shows the artist’s workplace. But unlike Matisse’s happy, colorful space, Picasso’s studio is bleak and dark, with no bright colors.

These two paintings were part of an exhibit at the Tate Modern Museum in London that brought Picasso and Matisse “together” by hanging their canvases side by side. Visitors got a chance to compare similarities in the artists’ styles. Both were interested in African art. Both were fascinated with collage, and with the female form. While Matisse was known for using bold colors and simple, yet energetic lines, he sometimes painted in the style of Cubism, a complex style invented by Picasso. Sometimes Picasso used bright colors and painted unusually dressed women. These characteristics are typically associated with Matisse.

Hanging the artists’ works next to each other was an idea that would have made sense to Picasso. He said at the end of his life, “You’ve got to be able to picture side by side everything Matisse and I were doing at the time.” Picasso added, “No one has looked at Matisse’s paintings more carefully than I; and no one has looked at mine more carefully than him.”

TIME to Connect

Matisse and Picasso sometimes inspired each other in their work—even if it was in the form of competition.

• Write a personal narrative describing who inspires you to achieve your goals and to do your best. Be sure to include a brief character sketch of that person, supporting your story with specific examples of how the person inspired you.
Building Vocabulary

On a separate sheet of paper, write the term that best matches each definition given below.

1. Standards of judgment.
2. An organized approach for studying a work of art.
3. The art criticism step in which you make a list of all the things you see in a work of art.
4. The art criticism step in which you discover how the principles of art are used to organize the art elements of line, color, shape, form, space, and texture.
5. The art criticism step in which you explain or tell the meaning or mood of the work.
6. The art criticism step in which you determine the degree of artistic merit of the work.
7. The aesthetic theory that focuses on realistic representation.
8. The aesthetic theory that places emphasis on the formal qualities.
9. The aesthetic theory that requires that a work of art must arouse a response of feelings, moods, or emotions in the viewer.

Reviewing Art Facts

Answer the following questions using complete sentences.

10. What will learning the steps of art criticism help you develop?
11. Define the four steps of art criticism.
12. Describe the three aesthetic theories.
13. If the organization of an artwork is most important to an art critic, which aesthetic theory would he or she hold?
14. When criticizing functional objects, what must you consider during interpretation besides beauty?
15. In what ways are the steps of art criticism different from the steps of art history operations? In what ways are they similar?

Thinking Critically About Art

16. Apply. Select something from your home that is used solely for aesthetic purposes. Critique it using the four steps of art criticism. When you are finished, ask yourself if the object seems different than it did before. Has your opinion of the object changed?

17. Analyze. Find a movie critic’s review of a current film in a newspaper or magazine. Read it carefully. Try to find statements that fit each of the four steps of art criticism.

18. Historical/Cultural Heritage. Learn about Georgia O’Keeffe’s exploration of nature and natural objects in the Meet the Artist feature on page 30. Nature was a major theme in O’Keeffe’s work. Compare and contrast her depiction of nature in the artwork on pages 316–317 with Ernst Kirchner’s depiction of a similar scene in Figure 2.8 on page 34.

Museum curators need to be skilled in art criticism to select, analyze, and write about artworks for exhibitions. Visit art.glencoe.com to compare and contrast career opportunities in art.

Linking to the Performing Arts

Dance pioneer Martha Graham uses the aesthetic qualities in the development of her modern dances. See how Graham uses literal qualities, design qualities, and expressive qualities through the use of body movement on page 414.